

To: kirk.barrett@montclair.edu[kirk.barrett@montclair.edu]
Cc: []
Bcc: []
From: CN=Alice Yeh/OU=R2/O=USEPA/C=US
Sent: Thur 5/13/2010 1:44:44 PM
Subject: RE: Department rebuttal at Passaic River Symposium?
<mailto:Janine.MacGregor@dep.state.nj.us>
<http://www.csam.montclair.edu/pri>
<mailto:Janine.MacGregor@dep.state.nj.us>
<http://www.library.ucsb.edu/istl/08-summer/article1.html>
<http://www.scimagojr.com/journalrank.php?category=0&area=2300&year=2008&count=10>
<http://www.csam.montclair.edu/pri>

Left you a phone message. I was forwarded a string of e-mails from Cliff Firstenberg about the rebuttal - I understand that you may be nervous about this whole thing going out of control with rebuttals of rebuttals - so in the interest of not derailing the conference time-wise, Ray Basso and I think that we should just not do the rebuttal thing at all. We've spoken to Janine MacGregor, who agrees. So (I hate to ask this) would you send out another agenda without the rebuttal? We will speak out mind during the Qs & As period, along with everyone else.

Let me know if we should discuss.

From: "Kirk Barrett" <kirk.barrett@mail.montclair.edu>
To: Ray Basso/R2/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Alice Yeh/R2/USEPA/US@EPA, "Janine MacGregor" <Janine.MacGregor@dep.state.nj.us>
Date: 05/12/2010 09:31 AM
Subject: RE: Department rebuttal at Passaic River Symposium?

That sounds good. I moved that talk right before a break to give some flexibility on time. I hope you can keep it to 5 minutes so it won't throw off the schedule.

When you've decided, let me know who the speaker will be.

Regards,
Kirk

Kirk R. Barrett, PhD, PE, PWS
Director, Passaic River Institute
Montclair State University, 116 Mallory
1 Normal Ave., Montclair, NJ 07043
phone: 973-655-7117 fax: 973-404-8559 email kirk.barrett@montclair.edu
web: <http://www.csam.montclair.edu/pri>

From: Basso.Ray@epamail.epa.gov [mailto:Basso.Ray@epamail.epa.gov]
Sent: Wednesday, May 12, 2010 7:37 AM
To: barrettki@mail.montclair.edu
Cc: Yeh.Alice@epamail.epa.gov; barrettki@mail.montclair.edu; 'Janine MacGregor'
Subject: RE: Department rebuttal at Passaic River Symposium?

Kirk, I think the plan is to work with DEP on a rebuttal, so we will need a time slot to do so. We still need to work out the details. Our goal is to try and keep it simple and have a joint statement that could be read

as the rebuttal. We will keep you in the loop as things develop. Thanks.

From: "Kirk Barrett" <kirk.barrett@mail.montclair.edu>
To: "Janine MacGregor" <Janine.MacGregor@dep.state.nj.us>, <barrettki@mail.montclair.edu>
Cc: Ray Basso/R2/USEPA/US@EPA, Alice Yeh/R2/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 05/11/2010 03:40 PM
Subject: RE: Department rebuttal at Passaic River Symposium?

Ray and Alice,

Is that what you'd prefer?

Regards,
Kirk
phone: 973-655-7117 fax: 973-404-8559 email kirk.barrett@montclair.edu

-----Original Message-----

From: Janine MacGregor [mailto:Janine.MacGregor@dep.state.nj.us]
Sent: Tuesday, May 11, 2010 3:35 PM
To: barrettki@mail.montclair.edu
Cc: basso.ray@epa.gov; yeh.alice@epa.gov
Subject: RE: Department rebuttal at Passaic River Symposium?

Hi all, I guess until we work that out with EPA, you should probably just list it as "Agency Comments" or something. That we EPA and DEP, or one of use speaking for both of us, could do the talking. I just talked to Ray and are technical folks are gonna work out who is saying what...plus I did not clear this up the chain yet.

Janine

Janine MacGregor
NJDEP - Site Remediation Program
CN 028, 401 East State Street, 6th floor
Trenton, NJ 08625
(609) 633-0784 (direct)
(609) 292-1250 (secretary)
(609) 777-1914 (fax)

NOTE: This E-Mail and its contents may be Privileged & Confidential due to the Attorney Client Privilege, Attorney Work Product, Deliberative Process or under the New Jersey Open Public Records Act.

>>> kirk.barrett@mail.montclair.edu 5/11/2010 12:46:13 PM >>>
Janine,

Ray Basso and Alice Yeh called me today.

They said they definitely want to rebut.
So I am putting them on the agenda.
You can work out with them who will actually
do the speaking, ok?

Regards,
Kirk

Kirk R. Barrett, PhD, PE, PWS
Director, Passaic River Institute
Montclair State University, 116 Mallory
1 Normal Ave., Montclair, NJ 07043
phone: 973-655-7117 fax: 973-404-8559 email kirk.barrett@montclair.edu
web: <http://www.csam.montclair.edu/pri>

-----Original Message-----

From: Janine MacGregor [mailto:Janine.MacGregor@dep.state.nj.us]
Sent: Tuesday, May 11, 2010 8:52 AM
To: barrettki@mail.montclair.edu
Subject: Re: Department rebuttal at Passaic River Symposium?

Hi Kirk, I spoke to Irene Kropp about the issue and I am preparing for
discussion with Commissioner Martin. I will not know anything till at least
Thursday. If you can wait till then it would be appreciated. Janine

Janine MacGregor
NJDEP - Site Remediation Program
CN 028, 401 East State Street, 6th floor
Trenton, NJ 08625
(609) 633-0784 (direct)
(609) 292-1250 (secretary)
(609) 777-1914 (fax)

NOTE: This E-Mail and its contents may be Privileged & Confidential due to
the Attorney Client Privilege, Attorney Work Product, Deliberative Process
or under the New Jersey Open Public Records Act.

>>> kirk.barrett@mail.montclair.edu 5/7/2010 4:54 PM >>>
Hi Janine,

I'd like to broadcast the agenda for the Passaic River Symposium by mid next
week.

So, I'd to talk with you about how/if the Department wishes to formally
rebut the presentation from ToxStrategies. If so, I'll need to move some
things around on the agenda, which may not be easy. If I don't hear from
you by Tuesday, I'll assume no formal rebuttal.

I certainly understand and appreciate your concerns about inaccurate
information being presented. That is why I have offered the chance to rebut.
I trust you understand the Institute's need to maintain a forum for a
spectrum of tenable contentions.

BTW, I went back and looked at the paper. It was published in "Science of the Total Environment" which is well regarded journal, published by Elsevier, which is a prestigious and reputable publisher of dozens of scientific journals. It was ranked in the Top 50 Environmental Sciences Journals by one study (see <http://www.library.ucsb.edu/istl/08-summer/article1.html>) and 98th out of 725 Environmental Sciences Journals in another system http://www.scimagojr.com/journalrank.php?category=0&area=2300&year=2008&country=&order=sjr&min=0&min_type=cd&page=1).

Given that the study has passed peer review in a reputable journal, I cannot dismiss it out of hand.

Regards,
Kirk

Kirk R. Barrett, PhD, PE, PWS
Director, Passaic River Institute
Montclair State University, 116 Mallory
1 Normal Ave., Montclair, NJ 07043
phone: 973-655-7117 fax: 973-404-8559 email kirk.barrett@montclair.edu
web: <http://www.csam.montclair.edu/pri>